

CITY OF CARMEL
CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES
APRIL 12, 2018, 6:00 P.M.
CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

In attendance:

Members Present: Nick Davis; Fred Swift; Rosemary Dunkle; Bill Sanders; Ron Carter

Members Not Present: Becky Feigh; Curtis Butcher

HPC Administrator: Mark Dollase; Sam Burgess

Guests: Jess Lawhead, Jim Shinaver

1. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order at 6:27 P.M. by Nick Davis.

2. Roll Call

Nick D.; Fred S.; Rosemary D.; Bill S.; Ron C.

3. Approval of Minutes (3-8-2018)

Bill S. motioned to approve the minutes and Fred S. seconded. Motion passed 4-0-1 (Ron Carter abstained, since he was not present at the March meeting.)

4. Hearing of Visitors

See Item 8 a.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness

No discussion

6. Financial Report

7. Old Business

a. Potential Local Historic Districts

- i. Preliminary application for designation of Plum Creek Corn Crib as a local conservation district (Petitioner: Plum Creek Farms Homeowners Association)

Bill S. made a motion to pursue designation based on preliminary application. Ron C. seconded. Motion passed 5-0. Ron C. asked if the barn associated with the Lynn Farm should be considered for designation in conjunction with the corn crib. Sam B. noted that it had been determined that including the barn in the same district would require a great deal of additional coordination and could delay the designation of the corn crib.

- ii. Wilkinson-Hull House

Ron C. mentioned that he had talked to Mark Brennan 2-3 weeks earlier. Commission discussed information indicating that Justin Moffett currently holds an option on the property. Nick D. asked if it was public knowledge that Moffett was considering acquiring and developing the property. Ron C. noted that there had been a presentation by Old Town Design Group. Nick D. recommended that the Commission establish contact with Moffett concerning

his interest in the site. Mark D. asked whether the Commission would like to move forward with the designation before or after the originally proposed district boundaries are adjusted. Mark D. suggested that it might be most advantageous for the Commission to act to designate first and revise the boundaries later. Ron C. expressed the expectation that Council would not adopt the designation with the boundaries as originally proposed and that he believed it would be more advantageous to settle the final boundaries and make sure the owners find them agreeable before presenting a district designation ordinance to Council. Commission discussed merits of defining district boundaries to include the existing farm lane, including its significance to the character of the property. Ron C. recommended adding language to the preservation plan to justify the inclusion of the farm lane in the district boundaries based on its significance to the context of the house. Mark D. mentioned that the current farm lane crosses a culvert that traverses Cool Creek, adding that if the path of the lane were diverted as part of a new development, a new crossing of the creek for the farm lane would have to be installed to maintain access to the house. Ron C. noted that the preservation plan should also make explicit the requirement to maintain the relationship between Cool Creek and the house.

iii. 3740 W. 106th St. (Larsen-Dunwoody House)

a. Public Hearing before City Council on May 7 will determine whether the property is designated as a local historic district.

b. Reimbursement to Indiana Landmarks for noticing expenses (\$113.11)

Fred S. motioned to approve expenses incurred by Indiana Landmarks on behalf of the CHPC for noticing the public hearing. Ron C. seconded. Motion passed 5-0.

iv. Thornhurst

Flo Brengle has expressed interest in a designation but her brother now holds the house. Staff is awaiting a response from him, but Flo indicated that he would likely be supportive. Staff have made multiple attempts to contact Evan Lurie regarding his interest in designation. Mark D. also added that Becky F. had expressed intention to resign from the Commission based on schedule conflicts. Formal letter of resignation has not yet been received. Becky is a resident of Thornhurst. Mark expressed hope that Ms. Feigh might be able to remain involved in the designation process.

8. New Business

a. Haney Clark Farm Barn, 627 E. 116th St. (Demolition Delay)

Guests Jess Lawhead and Jim Shinaver were present to discuss the property as representatives of the owners. Nick D. and Sam B. reported finding during an April 9 site visit that the barn retained very little of its original timber structure (only two bents) and none of its original rafters or exterior cladding, and that the few remaining structural members dating to the 19th century were in poor condition and not suitable for relocation to a new site for future use. Fred S. asked if the house on the site in question was also considered historic. Mark D. replied that the house technically sits on a separate parcel (the address of which is 11580 N. College Ave.) and is not recognized as historic on the Carmel and Clay Township Survey of Historic Properties. Fred S. also noted that a member of Carmel-Clay Historical Society (CCHS) had speculated that there was a historic log home contained within the house and asked if Mr. Lawhead or Mr. Shinaver could confirm whether this might be the case. Neither guest had entered the house, but Mr. Lawhead offered to assist CCHS in gaining access to the house to investigate. Fred S. moved not to take any further action on the Haney Clark Farm Barn and inform Mike Hollibaugh to release the Demolition permit for the property. Bill S. seconded. Motion passed 5-0.

b. Potentially endangered historic properties

Commission discussed possible threats to the following properties. In response to discussion, staff agreed to arrange a meeting with the Executive Director of the Carmel Redevelopment Commission (CRC) to discuss plans for properties owned by the CRC. Commission expressed concern about the condition and threats to the Wise House at 10750 Hazel Dell Road. Staff committed to investigating the use and future plans for the property and attempting to arrange a site visit.

- i. 10750 Hazel Dell Pkwy. (Owned by E & H Mueller Development, LLC)
- ii. 130 1st Ave. SW (Owned by Carmel Redevelopment Commission (CRC))
- iii. 40 1st Ave. NE (Owned by CRC)
- iv. 3000 W. 131st St. (Owned by Molina Properties, LLC)
- v. 10714 Ditch Road (Owned by 5 Aces, LLC)
- vi. 4026 W. 141st St. (Owned by Troy Family Real Estate, LLC)
- vii. 210 1st Ave. SW/Donald Swails, Jr. Fire Station (Owned by Carmel CRC)

c. Continuing education requirements for Certified Local Governments

Goal for education session in August. Fred S. suggested focusing on preservation strategies in a developing suburban environment. Staff will send information about education opportunities.

d. Commission photo

Attendance was not complete, so no photo was taken.

9. Other Business

10. Announcements

Mark D. noted that the May 10 meeting will have a significant amount of business and attendance will be important. Fred S. suggested gaining confirmation of plans to attend.

11. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned by Nick Davis at 7:44 PM.



Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson



Recording Secretary Sam Burgess

