

CITY OF CARMEL
CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES
DECEMBER 13, 2018, 6:00 P.M.
CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

In attendance:

Members Present: Nick D., Fred S., Curtis B., Rosemary D., Sue M., Bill S. (had to leave at 7:15).

Members Not Present: Ron Carter

HPC Administrator: Mark Dollase, Sam Burgess

Guests: Elise Montoya (owner of 155 Audubon Dr.)

1. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order by chairperson Nick Davis at 6:05 PM.

2. Roll Call (Nick D., Fred S., Ron C., Curtis B., Bill S., Rosemary D., Sue M.)

a) Vacancy on Commission filled – Introducing Sue Maki

Nick welcomed Sue to the Commission and stated that Commission members are available to help her to get acclimated.

3. Approval of Minutes (10-11-2018)

Rosemary noted that “November” should replace “September” on final page. Fred motioned to approve with the recommended correction. Bill seconded. Motion passed 6-0.

4. Hearing of Visitors

See 7-a-i. Nick introduced the proposed designation of Morrison-Carmel House Historic District. Sue recommended eliminating reference to “corn bin” on p. 25 and “5.9 miles” in the statement of significance. Sam noted that staff would encourage the CHPC to recommend the designation to City Council. Fred S. added that the home’s design by Avriel Shull is the principal reason for considering the house worthy of designation. Sue M. asked if the designation would affect current municipal work on nearby drainage. Elise responded that it would not. Sue made a motion to recommend the designation with the recommended revisions to City Council for adoption. Bill seconded. Nick asked if there was any other discussion and Sue asked if Mr. Morrison’s business partner had been notified of the designation process. Motion passed 6-0.

5. Certificates of Appropriateness

None

6. Financial Report

a. Creation of Non-Reverting Fund and Transfer of funds from 2018 to 2019 budget

Sam reported that the non-reverting fund had been established and City Council had voted to approve transfers of unassigned funds from 2018 to 2019 in November. Commission discussed whether the non-reverting fund would continue to exist.

7. Old Business

a. Potential Local Historic and Conservation Districts

i. 155 Audubon Drive (Morrison-Carmel House Historic District)

See "Hearing of Visitors."

ii. Wilkinson-Hull House

Sam reported that ad hoc committee would meet again in January and that Justin Moffett and members of the Brennan family (current owners) had participated in the second meeting. Sam noted that the committee and staff were concerned about Old Town Companies' proposal of a 2-acre site. Mark added that the designation process was moving forward slowly because of some of the complexities of the situation and commented that the CHPC had been patient with the designation effort. Fred S. noted that plan commission committee had voted in favor of Old Town's proposal 3-1. Mark noted that CHPC staff should speak with DOCS staff to make sure the proposed district boundaries are being considered amid the PUD process. Mark noted that the City has been aware of the designation process since January 2018.

iii. Plum Creek Corn Crib

Sam reported that approximately 20 homeowners attended Nov. 29 information session regarding conservation district designation. Fred S. asked if there was still potential to designate a district embracing all remaining Lynnwood Farm buildings and structures. Staff stated that this could eventually take place but it would be more time-effective to designate two separate districts and combine them into one non-contiguous district at a later date. Fred reminded the Commission that Lynnwood Farm had national and global significance and is worthy of designation. Curtis noted that the subdivision's bylaws and covenants require the HOA to maintain the buildings. Curtis stated that while the covenants are up for revision in the next year, a supermajority would be needed to alter the terms.

b. Discussion on 241 1st Ave. SE (Demolition Delay Ordinance)

Sam noted that an engineering study concerning the house's potential to be moved would be done during the week of December 17. The CHPC could then determine whether it would like to pursue the relocation of the house based on the findings. Sam also noted that a site on Sylvan Ln. owned by Carmel Clay School Board had been identified as the most viable site for relocation, but that the School Board had not yet been engaged regarding the possibility. Mark added that the "character building" designation under the Old Town Zoning Overlay might alternatively allow DOCS to deny the request for a demolition permit and keep the house on its original site. He mentioned that if DOCS ends up allowing a demolition permit, the CHPC may need to look more seriously at moving the house. Sue asked if Commissioners are welcome to join the visit of engineers to the house. Nick stated that members could join, based on precedent. Mark said staff would check with DOCS to see if Commissioners would be permitted to join. Commissioners discussed potential benefits of educating Plan Commission and Planning and Zoning Department on the general operations of the CHPC and the survey.

Curtis noted that a high school or trade school program might contribute to the rehabilitation of the house. Nick noted that this is a good idea but that the current resident

will likely continue to reside in the house and that the property would continue to deteriorate if not sold.

Rosemary made a Motion to request that DOCS extend demolition delay period to 30 days. Fred seconded. Motion carried 6-0.

c. Franklin Booth House (321 N. Rangeline Rd.)

Sue noted that the house came to her attention when it was for sale. Booth was a significant illustrator who worked from the 1890s through the 1930s, documenting WWI scenes and illustrating James Whitcomb Riley books and stories. He lived in NYC but returned to family home in Carmel in summers and worked in a studio in the back yard. Sue recounted County Historian David Heighway's belief that the Booth house was worthy of preservation. The house had recently been listed at \$399,000, but sale was pending at the time of the meeting. Sue said she would try to work on promoting the preservation of the house. The house is currently configured as a duplex but changes could be reversed. Curtis recommended talking to Stephanie Marshall, who has information about the house.

Mark noted as an aside that the CHPC should consider whether it will do façade grants in 2019. Nick expressed support for continuing the program. Fred asked if the program could be adjusted to favor more historically significant structures. Mark noted that the scoring structure had been changed to favor late 19th c. or early 20th c. structures.

8. New Business

a. Request for proposals for update to 2014 Carmel and Clay Township Historic Architecture Survey

Mark recounted that the survey update would make the existing survey comprehensive rather than representational and capture properties that have aged into historic status since the original survey was done. Mark explained that the March 1 response deadline was proposed by staff so the RFP could be issued in January. Nick expressed that he would prefer RFP to be released early in January and responses should be due in February in time for CHPC to consider at its next meeting so work could begin before foliage obscures certain historic properties from visibility from the public ROW. Sue made a motion to approve the issuance of the RFP in January with a March 1 deadline for an updated survey of historic resources in the city of Carmel, Indiana. Curtis seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

Mark added that CLG status requires a survey update every 10 years.

9. Other Business

a. Nick reminded CHPC of continuing education requirements. Mark reminded CHPC of 2019 Preserving Historic Places conference in Evansville.

10. Announcements

a. None

11. Adjournment

Nick D. adjourned the meeting at 7:42 PM.



Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson



Recording Secretary Sam Burgess

