

CITY OF CARMEL
CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 13, 2018, 6:00 P.M.
CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

In attendance:

Members Present: Nick D., Fred S., Curtis B., Rosemary D. (Fred S. left for another obligation at 7:03 PM)

Members Not Present: Ron C., Bill S.

HPC Administrator: Mark Dollase, Sam Burgess

Guests: Joe and Desra Simons; Richard Feigh; Emily Ehrgott

1. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order at 6:09 P.M. by Chairman Nick Davis.

2. Roll Call

Nick D. noted during the roll call that Becky Feigh's letter of resignation had been received. Fred S. noted that Emily Ehrgott would be a candidate for the vacancy.

3. Approval of Minutes (6-14-2018)

Fred motioned to approve the minutes and Rosemary seconded. Motion passed unanimously 4-0.

4. Old Business

a) Potential Local Historic and Conservation Districts

i. Wilkinson-Hull House

Sam B. noted that there had been a meeting among ad hoc committee members, commission staff and chair, and Justin Moffett at the Wilkinson-Hull House to discuss treatment of the house and its setting amid development. Sam B. also noted that a letter had been sent to the owners of the house care of Mark Brennan on behalf of the Commission indicating the intention to keep moving forward with designation. Nick D. asked to be notified when the next ad hoc committee meeting is set.

ii. Plum Creek Corn Crib

Mark D. reported that staff had met with owners of the corn crib during the meeting to discuss the condition of the structure and approaches to remedying structural deficiencies that would satisfy the terms of the façade grant program. Staff told the owners that it would be preferable to keep all shoring temporary, while contractors had proposed installation of permanent steel plates between two rows of tension bands on north and south sides. Mark noted that the permanent plates could still satisfy the standards of the façade grant program if they were deemed absolutely necessary for the longevity of the structure, but not if the structure could be stabilized without the permanent installation of plates.

b) Vacancy on Commission

Staff presented resumes for two candidates for the vacancy on the Commission, Emily Ehrgott and Perrin Slowey. Nick D. stated that he would send digital copies of both resumes to Mayor Brainard for his consideration.

c) National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Code of Ethics

Fred S. made a motion to adopt the code and Rosemary seconded. Motion passed 4-0.

2. New Business

a) Potential sites for relocation of endangered historic buildings in Old Town

Sam B. noted that there are several potentially endangered houses in Old Town Carmel and suggested that it would be valuable to develop a list of potential sites for the relocation of historic resources in the area. Emily E. noted that Arts District arches could impede the moving of a house along certain corridors. Fred S. noted that houses in Old Town would probably have to be moved to new sites within Old Town. Sam B. added that concerns over the anticipated demolition of 241 1st Ave. SE had prompted the inclusion of this discussion item on the agenda and that the property on 1st Ave. SE would be a major topic of discussion at the October 11 meeting of the CHPC.

b) Façade grant applications

Staff delivered a presentation on the following façade grant applications:

Address: 8 Thornhurst Dr.

Applicants: Rebecca and Richard Feigh

Replacement of glazing in three original windows on main façade

Requested grant amount: \$200.70 to \$449.45

Staff Score: 40/60

Address: 12401 Lynnwood Dr.

Applicant: Kelly Kluesner and Rebecca Irons on behalf of Plum Creek Golf Club

Repainting of historic barn siding, trim, soffits, silos, and windows

Requested grant amount: \$5,000.00

Staff Score: 41/60

Address: 130 Woodland Lane

Applicant: Laurel Toney

Painting/repainting of exterior redwood siding and trim

Requested grant amount: \$500.00 to \$675.00

Staff Score: 39/60

Address: 452 Emerson Rd.

Applicants: Joe and Desra Simons

Replacement of existing roof with three-tab or architectural shingles

Requested grant amount: \$3,325.00 to \$3,475.00

Staff Score: 35/60

Contingency: Must use three-tab shingles.

Address: 1630 Royalton Drive

Applicant: Mark Barnett

Replacement of original wood windows with contemporary non-wood windows intended to resemble the original fenestration

Requested grant amount: \$2,020.25 to \$5,000.00

Staff Score: 29/60

Address: 12006 Eden Glen

Applicants: Mark Cade and Florina Scarlat

Replacement of original insulated glass with new insulated glass on six original wood windows. Replacement of deteriorated sash on window left of front entry with new, in-kind wood sash.

Requested grant amount: \$813.75

Staff Score: 39/60

Sam B. and Mark D. recommended approving all façade grant applications that received a staff score of 30/60 or higher, suggesting that each successful application be approved for 25% of the lowest estimate for the job, up to a total of \$5,000 per grant. Nick D. said he would entertain a motion to approve façade grants as recommended by staff, specifying that the Commission not approve the grant application for 1630 Royalton Dr. and that the approval of the application for 130 Woodland Lane be should contingent upon requiring the use of paint rather than stain on original wood siding and trim. Rosemary D. made such a motion and Fred S. seconded. The motion passed 4-0, resulting in the commitment of façade grant funding for all properties listed above with the exception of 1630 Royalton Dr.

c) Prospective 2018 Survey Additions

Staff delivered a presentation on the candidates for addition to the Carmel and Clay Township Historic Architecture Survey listed below. Mr. Swift had left the meeting by the end of the meeting presentation such that there was no longer a quorum and the Commission could not take official action on the proposed additions. The remaining Commission members and staff agreed that it would be appropriate to revisit the topic at the October 11 meeting.

- Woodland Springs Club House, 3535 E. 116th St.
Designed by Avriel Shull
 - 540 1st Ave. SE
 - 10825 Cornell Ave.
24-Hour Home
Prior to leaving the meeting, Fred S. noted that the house predated many other prefab houses and was constructed in 1915. The house was meant to be built in 24 hours. A historic plaque indicates the home's status. Fred noted that this is the only house of its kind left in Carmel.
- d) 416 Smokey Row Road (Benjamin Chappel House)
Commission staff reported having received notification that Justin Moffett had recently acquired land including the house and was believed to intend to develop the land for 55-and-over clientele.
- e) Potential historic or conservation district for Home Place
Emily E. noted that she had spoken to Doug Callahan of Clay Township regarding the significance of historic properties in Home Place and would be in touch with Commission staff regarding next steps.
- f) Retainer increase for Indiana Landmarks staffing services
Nick D. opted to consider this item between items b) and c) so the Commission could take official action before Fred S. had to leave. Mark D. noted that Indiana Landmarks will need to raise its fee to \$7,500.00 per annum to cover our commitments. Curtis made a motion that CHPC approve an increase in fees to \$7,500. Rosemary seconded. The motion carried 4-0.
- g) Closure of unclaimed 2016 façade grants for 815 College Way and 11932 Pebble Brook Lane
Nick indicated that it should be on record that the two noted accounts have been closed.
- h) Transfer of funds from 2018 to 2019 budget
Fred S. made a motion to request to transfer funds in the amount of \$65,453.25 to 2019 budget. Curtis B. seconded. Motion carried 4-0.
- i) Certified Local Government (CLG) Audit
Staff reported that the CHPC was deemed substantially compliant with CLG standards by State government but needs to boost participation in continuing education opportunities. Staff indicated that they would work to promote and provide new educational opportunities. Mark D. noted that staff could tailor educational opportunities to the Commission's interests. Nick D. expressed a desire for more education about the historic resource types found specifically in Carmel.

3. Other Business

Curtis B. reported that he had spoken to Eric Brock, property manager for the Wise House at 10750 Hazel Dell Parkway, and learned that the owners are pleased with their current tenant and are not currently interested in selling the property, but Mr. Brock indicated that he would contact Curtis/the CHPC to facilitate an effort to save the house if the current tenants leave and the owners decide to sell. Nick D. recommended sending a letter to the owners with contact information for staff.

4. Announcements

None

5. Adjournment

Meeting was adjourned by Nick Davis at 7:16 PM.



Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson



Recording Secretary Sam Burgess

(Neither Bill nor Ron will be present for the September meeting.)

