

CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
MAY 9, 2019, 6:00 P.M.
CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

Agenda

1. Call to Order

2. Roll Call

(Nick Davis, Fred Swift, Ron Carter, Curtis Butcher, Bill Sanders, Rosemary Dunkle, Sue Maki)

Meeting was called to order at 6:06 PM

Members present: Curtis, Sue, Nick, Fred, Rosemary (Bill arrived at 6:23 PM)

Members not present: Ron Carter

Guest: Jonathon Fruchte

3. Approval of Minutes (4-18-2019) Sue motioned. Fred seconded. Approved, 5-0.

4. Hearing of Visitors

Commission first considered grant request of Jonathon Fruchte, owner of 9610 Deerfield Mall. See summary of discussion below under New Business, a., 6.

5. Certificates of Appropriateness

6. Financial Report

Include summary in minutes.

7. New Business

a. Spring 2019 Façade Improvement Grant Applications

1. 31 Thornhurst Dr., Bob and Melissa Shelton

Exterior restoration including rehabilitation and partial replacement of entry window wall; cleaning and repointing of brick; repair and repainting of wood trim and detail.

Staff Rating: 44/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$3,348.52

Staff indicated that the components of the proposal involving wood trim and brick would warrant approval, with the stipulation that original materials be conserved to the greatest extent possible, and that a minimal amount of material be replaced. Staff emphasized that the transition from single- to double-pane windows would change the appearance of the house – especially in terms of glare and reflectivity. Mark reminded the Commission that they had previously approved a grant in 2018 for the repair (with single-pane glass) rather than the replacement of original windows on the Feighs' property in Thornhurst.

Rosemary made a motion to approve a grant award in the requested amount with the stipulation that all staff recommendations be complied with,

including single-pane windows, pending confirmation by staff that the applicants meet the requirement of being owner-occupants of 31 Thornhurst Drive. Curtis seconded. Fred noted that the house is arguably not owner-occupied. Curtis noted that the terms of the grant program could possibly be amended to specify, for homes, that properties must be primary residences of the applicants. Motion carried 5-1-0 (abstention by Sue).

2. 40 E. Main St., Carmel Library Associates, LLC

Refinishing of both sides of front (south) doors and outer faces of inner airlock doors; refinishing of handrail on front steps; repair or replacement of east side entrance door.

Staff Rating: 43/60

Requested Grant Amount: Up to \$3,750

Staff indicated that the application did not include current estimates for the proposal. Commissioners also discussed the fact that property is not owner-occupied. Sue made a motion to decline the application on the basis of the fact that it was incomplete and because the property did not meet the owner-occupancy requirement, but to encourage the owner to resubmit a complete application for a future grant cycle in the event that the grant eligibility requirements were modified to eliminate the stipulation for owner-occupancy. Rosemary seconded. Motion carried, 6-0.

3. 50 Bennett Road, Patrick and Mary Kristine Fuller

Restoration of garage to its original purpose after long-time use as living space. Frame wall in garage opening to be replaced with garage door. Exterior trim to be repaired and repainted.

Staff Rating: 39/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$643.28

Staff recommended approving, with the stipulation that the replacement garage door be made of wood and have either a flush-panel design, or a 4X8 configuration of raised or recessed panels. Curtis made a motion to approve a grant for 25% of applicable project costs or \$1,000 (whichever is less) on the condition that the project comply with all staff recommendations, and on the condition that the applicant work with CHPC staff to identify a suitable new garage door. Rosemary seconded. Motion carried, 6-0.

4. 815 College Way, Tawni Gray

Painting of original door and wood siding with mid-century color scheme; installation of period-appropriate light fixture hanging from ceiling of recessed front porch; refinishing of front porch slab.

Staff Rating: 33/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$850-\$1,200

Staff noted that application was incomplete for lack of photographs and certain material and product specifications. Staff also indicated that proposed painting scheme could detract from the property's ability to convey its historic significance. Rosemary made a motion to deny the application. Fred seconded. Motion carried, 6-0.

5. 3848 E. 106th St., Matty Frank

Restoration of upper two limestone front steps of early 20th-century schoolhouse and in-kind replacement of bottom limestone front step.

Staff Rating: 46/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$703.75-\$1,103.75

Staff recommended approving the grant request with two stipulations: 1) applicant and contractor must first investigate the ability to reuse the lowest step by turning it over rather than replacing it; and 2) if it is ultimately concluded that the existing lowest step cannot be used, the step must be replaced with a single piece of sawcut limestone. Fred moved to approve the grant request with the two staff stipulations. Rosemary seconded. Motion carried, 6-0.

6. 9610 Deerfield Mall, Jonathan and Megan Fruchte

Reconstruction of original central chimney with limestone or concrete to replace uppermost courses to improve drainage.

Staff Rating: 36/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$1,450

Sam noted that the most appropriate solution would be a design that would preserve the original appearance of the chimney while also addressing water intrusion issues. Mark added that when the CHPC provides funding for the project, they need to make sure they are commensurate with the intentions of the grant program. Mark added that, as noted in the grant application, corbelled chimneys are typical of the houses in Deerfield. Mark asked if it would be possible to replace only the upper courses of the chimney. Jonathon Fruchte stated that contractors had indicated that there was too much damage to the lower courses of the chimney to justify their retention. Jonathon also stated that it could be difficult for contractors to warrantee the project if the chimney were rebuilt with four reverse-corbelled courses on top. Mark asked if there had been any consideration of using a pitched cement on top of the exposed flat upper surfaces of the reverse-corbelled bricks to shed water and snow. Bill stated that the objective of the program is to preserve what is already there. Bill added that many restoration projects should be regarded as maintenance measures, which will last a finite length of time and will need to be repeated. Commissioners discussed the possibility of using a chamfered/canted brick on the upper four courses so the reverse corbelling could be retained in the upper four courses while improving drainage. Sue made a motion to approve a grant for the amount requested with the contingency that chimney be reconstructed according to the original design or with canted brick in lieu of standard bricks for the upper four courses, as agreed upon in greater detail through consultation with CHPC staff, with approval for funding in the amount of up to \$2,000 at the discretion of staff to offset any additional costs incurred through the use of canted brick. Bill seconded. Motion passed 6-0.

7. 9680 Haverstick Road, Zelma Taylor and Gordon Goodwin

Replacement of non-original shutters with properly sized and operating custom shutters milled to match historic shutters pictured in c. 1902 photo.

Staff Rating: 47/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$1,875-\$1,940.27

Staff recommended approving the grant request with the stipulation that the project be completed as specified in the bid submitted by R.S. Tatum LLC, given that this proposal seemed to be the most appropriate to the historic character of the house and the construction methods that would have been used to produce the original shutters. Staff also recommended stipulating

that homeowner, contractor, and CHPC staff should discuss reasons for the proposed use of western red cedar for the new shutters before production. Bill S. left at 8:06 P.M. before a vote was taken on this item. Fred made a motion to approve the grant request with the stipulations specified by staff. Curtis seconded. Motion carried, 5-0.

8. 1730 Royalton Dr., Jim Crane

Custom production and installation of under-window balcony railing on addition to match similar feature on original portion of house.

Staff Rating: 31/60

Requested Grant Amount: \$973.75

Staff indicated that the proposal might be considered asynchronous with the purpose of the grant program, as it involves the fabrication of a feature that was not originally part of the house rather than the restoration or reconstruction of an original feature. Sue motioned to decline the application, and Curtis seconded. Motion carried, 5-0.

b. 416 W. Smokey Row Road (“The Maples”)

Staff reported that Old Town Companies was expected to acquire the historic property, including a 19th-century I-House, which Old Town expects to designate as a local historic district following acquisition. Staff had recently made a site visit and was in the process of providing consultation to Old Town regarding recommendations for preservation.

c. 2018 façade grant, 1650 Royalton Drive

Commissioners reviewed an appeal by the owner of 1650 Royalton Drive, David Dettmer, from the CHPC staff’s decision to offer partial reimbursement for a 2018 façade grant project that only partially fulfilled the requirements that the CHPC had specified for the successful redemption of the grant award. Commission members expressed continued support of CHPC staff’s decision to offer a partial award of \$3,540 rather than \$5,000. It was noted that a new vote was not needed, as the CHPC had already voted to vest staff with the authority to issue a final judgment regarding the grant in question at its January 2019 meeting. Nick requested that staff send a letter to Mr. Dettmer on behalf of the CHPC indicating that the Commission supports staff’s judgment regarding the grant.

8. Old Business

a. Discussion on 241 1st Ave. SE (Demolition Delay Ordinance)

Staff indicated that the relocation of the house to the property of Joe and Kristi Bishop at 5501 E. Main Street was being pursued.

b. Local Historic and Conservation Districts

i. Plum Creek Corn Crib Conservation District designation process

Staff noted that the public hearing regarding the designation would take place at the May 20 City Council meeting.

ii. Wilkinson-Hull House

Nick and staff reported on continuing communication with Old Town Companies to coordinate the designation of the house and a portion of its surroundings as a local historic district following Old Town’s acquisition of the property.

9. Other Business

None

10. Announcements

Nick announced that his family now plans to remain in Carmel and that he will continue to serve as CHPC Chair.

11. Adjournment

Nick adjourned the meeting at 8:32 PM.

Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson

Recording Secretary Sam Burgess