

CITY OF CARMEL
CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES
SEPTEMBER 19, 2019, 6:00 P.M.
CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

In attendance:

Members Present: Nick Davis, Curtis Butcher, Rosemary Dunkle, Bill Sanders

Members Not Present: Ron Carter, Sue Maki, Fred Swift

HPC Administrator: Mark Dollase

Guests:

1. Call to Order

Meeting was called to order by Nick D. at 6:06 PM.

2. Roll Call (Nick D., Curtis B., Bill S., Rosemary D.)

3. Approval of Minutes Rosemary moved to approve the minutes of the August 8, 2019 meeting; Curtis seconded. Motion approved 4-0.

4. Hearing of Visitors

None

5. Certificates of Appropriateness

None

6. Financial Report

7. New Business

a. Fall 2019 Façade Improvement Grant Applications

1. 155 Audubon Drive, Fernando and Elise Montoya

Mark reported on the scoring of 52/60 for this property, and explained its priority funding status given that it is locally protected by the City. The owners could apply for up to \$10,000, but given their project budget were eligible to receive \$9,513.00. The scope of work includes a new roof, replacement of gutters and downspouts and tuckpointing to a chimney at the rear of the house.

2. E. 126th Street and Plum Creek Drive, Plum Creek Farms HOA

Mark gave an overview of this project, which includes a scope of work of power washing, scraping, priming and painting of the corncrib. This property is also designated a locally protected property, and therefore is eligible for up to \$10,000, the amount requested by the HOA. The total project budget is \$30,000. Mark gave this project a score of 55/60.

3. 1201 E. 106th Street, Philip and Virginia Ranly

The Ranly's c.1840 house and garage would include a scope of work for selective wood repair, scraping and painting. The structures will be painted yellow again, but a lighter

shade than the current bold color. This property is not locally designated, but in the Architecture survey; based upon the project cost the request grant amount is \$2,500.00. Mark provided the project a score of 53/60.

4. 3535 E. 116th Street, Woodland Springs Neighborhood Association, Inc.

This property was added to the Historic Architecture Survey recently with approval by City Council. The building was designed by Avriel Shull and built as the clubhouse for the Woodland Springs subdivision. Their project includes the replacement of existing wood rear deck and repairs to smaller side deck. Mark reported a score of 46/60, and recommended approval of a grant of \$2,792.80.

5. 5155 E. 116th Street, White Chapel

Mark gave this project a score of 51/60 for replacement of the existing roof with new roof of shingles similar to original shake roof. Chimney flashing will also be replaced. The 1853 structure, despite changes, is an important local landmark and the roof project qualifies and will provide long-term protection. Mark recommended a score of 51/60, and funding in the amount of \$5,000.00

6. 1030 E. 106th Street, Richard Jordan

Mark expressed that Mr. Jordan's application was not entirely clear as to whether desired front porch railings were to be vinyl or wood. It appears it is to be vinyl railing on porch and steps where none presently exists. Mr. Jordan has requested \$600.00 for the project. The project was scored at just 35/60; its possible that if Mr. Jordan would use wood, the Commission would approve the request, but not vinyl. If he would rebid and the price would increase, the CHPC would be willing to increase grant award.

Several motions were made to address issues with façade grant applications. Rosemary made the motion to increase the budget of façade grant awards from \$25,000 maximum to the \$30,405.80 in applications received. Curtis Butcher seconded the motion, passed unanimously 4-0. Rosemary made a motion to approve all six façade grant applications, with staff approval granted to iron out details on 1030 E. 106th, to resolve proposed vinyl railings so owner will consider wood. Bill Sanders seconded. The motion passed unanimously 4-0. Bill Sanders made the motion that the Commission will defer design review to the Administrator for 155 Audubon and Plum Creek Farms Corn crib, as they are locally designated and will require a COA. Rosemary seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously 4-0.

b. Demo Delay Review: Karl Meyer, 331 1st St SW

Mark reported that he met with Karl Meyer, an applicant to demolish an addition and a garage at 331 1st St. SW. Meyer plans to renovate the house. Given the specifics of the situation, Mark felt that the Commission should not pursue relocation of the structure or Interim Protection. The Commissioners agreed.

c. Meeting re: historic Carmel Methodist Church

Mark reported that he, along with Fred and Sue, met with Pastor Napier at the Methodist Church to discuss their early Methodist building. Fred stated that the building could be donated, and then relocated to property of the church if they were interested. Napier indicated she would discuss with her leadership and get back with the Commission.

8. Old Business

a. Historic Architecture Survey Update

The contract was taken to the Carmel Board of Public Works, where the survey update was approved. Mark reported that he had been informed by NS Services that due to changes in staffing, they were no longer able to undertake the Contract for the survey update. Decisions will need to be made regarding rebidding the project.

b. Wilkinson-Hull House

Mark indicated he had reached out to Justin Moffett, and not received a response. He'll try again, and it was suggested reaching out to one of his colleagues, Rebecca McGuckin.

9. Other Business

None

10. Announcements

11. Adjournment

Nick adjourned the meeting at 7:07 PM.



Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson



Recording Secretary Mark Dollase