

CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
JULY 9, 2020, 6:00 P.M.
MICROSOFT TEAMS VIRTUAL MEETING

CONFERENCE ID: 862 298 587#

Minutes

1. Call to Order

Nick called the meeting to order at 6:04 pm

2. Roll Call

Commissioners: Nick Davis, Fred Swift, Curtis Butcher, Rosemary Dunkle, Sue Maki (arrived late)

Staff: Mark Dollase, Joshua Biggs

Visitors: Bryan Ragan, Bryan Ragan Construction; Haylee Moscato, RQAW; Kyle Boot, RQAW; Madison Story, RQAW; Michael Mercho, owner of 605 W. Main St; Chris and Abby Murphy, owners of 771 1st Ave NW; and Connie Zeigler who is working with RQAW.

3. Approval of Minutes (6/11/2020)

Nick made a motion to approve the June meeting minutes. There was a motion by Rosemary and a second by Fred. Motion was approved unanimously.

4. Hearing of Visitors

Nick asked if guests in attendance regarding the demolition delay proceedings should speak now. Mark suggested that we stay in the order of the agenda.

5. Certificates of Appropriateness

None

6. Financial Report

Josh said that he followed up with Spring 2019 façade grant award winners to see if they were still interested in completing projects. He also mentioned that the cost of postage for the Summer 2020 façade grant invitation letters was \$249.50. Josh asked that a motion be

made to approve the charge to be reimbursed to Indiana Landmarks. Nick called for a motion. Fred moved and Rosemary seconded. Motion approved 5-0.

7. Old Business

a. Survey update

Mark mentioned that several guests with RQAW are in attendance at the meeting and Nick opened up the commission meeting as a public hearing, per the executed contract with RQAW. Mark mentioned that the commission had entered into a contact with RQAW; albeit the commencement of work was stalled due to unforeseen circumstances.

Kyle Boot introduced himself, and mentioned that Connie Zeigler, Haylee Moscato, and Madison Story would be assisting him in the project.

Kyle stated that project goals were to complete a comprehensive survey within six previously identified neighborhoods, which are Deerfield, Johnson Addition, Walter's Rolling Acres, Carmel Village, Carmel Old Town, and Lady Hamilton Estates. Kyle mentioned that some areas surveyed in their entirety and some were surveyed on a representative level. He also mentioned that the team would conduct a windshield survey of the rest of Carmel and Clay Township. Furthermore, the surveyors will identify and recommend up to five new historic districts and complete a comprehensive survey of those five new districts, up to 220 resources.

Kyle furthermore outlined that in the six previously identified districts, the surveyors would identify significant alterations, and survey the districts in their entirety. Kyle asked if there should be a survey card entry for properties built after 1980 and whether to note them as noncontributing resources, or just to skip over them. He asked this because Carmel Old Town has a significant number of properties built after 1980.

Regarding the Deerfield subdivision, Kyle recommended a few changes to the district boundaries. Inaccuracies or inconsistencies with some of the surveyed properties were mentioned, and it was recommended that the surveyors notate these inconsistencies or errors on a district-level. Kyle also mentioned surveying resources outside of the six previously identified districts.

Kyle mentioned that CHPC staff person, Josh Biggs had provided a list of approximately 30 historic resources that were missed in the previous survey. Kyle asked about 130 E. Main Street purportedly being a former Methodist church. It was noted that Fred Swift may have some information about the church. Mark asked Fred what the source of the information was regarding 130 E. Main being a former church. Fred stated that owner, Tom Henshaw was one source, per a conversation with Fred, and that Tom had heard it was a church. Kyle noted that a windshield survey of historic resources would occur. The surveyors will use Hamilton County GIS maps and property cards to determine which areas were constructed

prior to 1980. Furthermore, the surveyors will recommend up to five new potential historic districts, including Home Place, Eden Glen, Hussey Lane, and Annaly Downs. Kyle noted that the surveyors will comprehensively survey up to 5 new districts, with up to 220 resources. He furthermore mentioned that the team will prepare and send a draft report to the commission with survey entries, make revisions as needed, and send the final report to commission, followed by a final presentation.

Kyle stated that the project team will have letters on their person to carry with them and badges when they talk with property owners. Kyle said he wants to send letters to potential neighborhood contacts, which he will work with Mark and Josh to accomplish. Following the completion of the survey, RQAW will conduct quality control measures and review property cards to limit inconsistencies or errors. Kyle will communicate regularly with Mark and Josh, and provide monthly updates

Fred opined that the scope of survey work sounds sufficient. Mark said he can update the commission as needed about the survey. Kyle said that they received the executed contract on June 18 and are scheduled to complete work by March 20, 2021. Kyle also reviewed the schedule of work that RQAW will perform.

Mark talked about resources constructed after 1980. One of the goals the commission wanted to accomplish was to make the survey comprehensive; consequently, there will be an increasing number of noncontributing resources in the survey. There was discussion about surveying noncontributing resources and notating them as such in the Old Town area. Kyle said that this could be accomplished as part of the survey, particularly in Old Town.

Mark asked the other team members from RQAW if they had any comments. Connie Zeigler mentioned that a number of people made the comment about neighborhood interest in listing Johnson Addition as a conservation district. Mark mentioned that he's glad to hear of the interest, but conservation district status has been attempted in the past but was ultimately vetoed.

b. Summer façade grants

Mark reminded the commission that at the June meeting, they approved a summer round of façade grants. Mark mentioned that he has already been contacted about the grant and has also made a site visit.

Josh mentioned that he sent out the invitation letters and that he's also receiving interest about the grant. Mark said that per the invitation letter, those interested in the grant will contact Josh. Josh said that the commission's website was recently updated with accurate information about the façade grant program.

c. National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Forum, August 3-9

Josh reminded the commission about the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Forum from August 3 through August 9, being held virtually. He also stated that participation in the conference would fulfill the commission's continuing education requirement, due to the city's Certified Local Government status. Nick asked if the classes would be archived to be able to watch later, which the answer is yes.

Josh stated that there was money in the budget to pay for each of the commission members to participate in the conference, and that cost per person would be \$100. Fred motioned to approve the allotment of funds from the budget to pay for each commission member to participate in the conference. Rosemary seconded the motion. Motion approved 5-0.

8. New Business

Mark made the comment that the number of demolition reviews before the commission this evening was the largest that the commission had seen at one time. Mark reminded the commission of the two types of action they could take: decide that the structure is of enough historic significance that the commission would seek to relocate, or place the structure under interim protection, with protection continuing until local designation.

a. Proposed demolition at 771 1st Ave. NW

Mark said this property was characterized as a "character building" with the Department of Community Services. He also mentioned that he visited the property today with Josh to meet with the owner; it was noted that the house is a ca. 1900 or 1910 workers cottage with a high degree of historic integrity remaining. Some of the historic details were outlined. Mark said that the foundation appears to be in great shape. The plans for the site are to remove the house and enlarge the side yard.

Chris and Abby Murphy, who participated in the virtual meeting, introduced themselves. Chris stated that they bought the property in 2017 with the intention of renovating the house. Chris said that it was determined that the house would be cost-prohibitive to renovate. Fred asked if the house was large and significant enough to move it to another location. Mark mentioned that he got a call from Rebecca McGuckin from Old Town Design Group and she mentioned in a voicemail to Mark that there was potential interest in relocating this house to the site as well. The development site in question is near Smokey Row Road west of the Monon Trail. Mark opined that moving the structure would prove difficult due to the limited number of available sites in the City of Carmel. Mark also mentioned that the house was not in poor condition or in danger of collapse. Mark asked

Josh if anyone had called him inquiring about the structure. No one had inquired, but Josh did say that the "Building Available for Relocation" sign was updated with the correct phone number, as well as the phone number on the website.

Mark's comments to the commission were to not recommend interim protection and not to attempt to try and relocate the structure ourselves. Mark mentioned that the Murphys said they would forgo the demolition permit at this time to allow the Commission to figure out an alternative. Chris said they would be open to this as long as it was done in a reasonable time period. Mark said he would follow up with Rebecca McGuckin about the house.

Nick called for a motion. Sue suggested that the commission wait one week to hear back from Old Town Design Group, and if no response, to allow the owners to proceed with demolition. Fred asked if one week was enough and suggest waiting two weeks. Mark asked the owners if what is approved tonight allows the demolition proceedings to continue, if the commission can have some time to work with Old Town Design Group on a solution; perhaps one month. Nick asked how far along in the demolition delay process we were. The process started in June.

Sue made a motion to not oppose the demolition of 771 1st Ave. NW, with a second by Rosemary, and that the demolition permit could not be pulled until the expiration of the 60-day demolition period (mid-August). Motion approved 5-0.

b. Proposed demolition at 310 2nd St. SW

Mark introduced Bryan Ragan who is the contractor for this project. Mark said that plans were distributed to the commission that show the replacement of the mid-20th century Minimal Traditional house with a modern single-family home.

Bryan said that the block structure is starting to mold and deteriorate in the basement. He also said that the new house would be a two-story brick structure with an attached garage.

Mark asked the commissioners if they had any questions about the existing structure or new house. Fred opined that he didn't think the existing house had any historic or architectural significance and Curtis agreed. Rosemary motioned to not move the house or place it under interim protection, with a second by Fred. Motion passes 5-0. Bryan said that utilities to the existing house will be disconnected any day and that the house has been inspected.

c. Proposed demolition at 130 and 210 Veterans Way

Mark told the commission about a demolition request for the old fire museum in Old Town Carmel. He said it's a fairly functional structure in terms of design, that it was constructed around 1950, and that it was formerly a fire station and then a museum. Mark also said that a new fire station and museum are being proposed for the site, and that two buildings in the Carmel/Clay Township historic architecture survey are to be demolished as part of the project.

Mark asked if the commissioners if they had any individual thoughts about the project. Nick was on an email list from the city and said there were some historically significant materials that he requested be salvaged as part of the new project.

Sue asked the question, "How do we change the culture in Carmel and save historic buildings?" Fred said we can't or shouldn't hold up the project. Mark asked Nick about the salvage and who those salvaged pieces were going to: the City, the fire buffs, or the Carmel Clay Historical Society? Fred said the new façade is a copy of the façade of the old building.

Sue made a motion to not oppose the demolition of either of the two buildings nor to place them under Interim Protection. The motion was seconded by Fred. Motion approved 5-0.

Mark said that he will inform Mike Hollibaugh tomorrow of the vote.

c. Proposed demolition at 605 W. Main Street

Mark introduced this fourth demolition request, which he said was initiated on May 19th. Mark said that the applicant didn't think he was subject to the 60-day demolition delay ordinance because he had worked through the process years earlier.

Mark said this property was on lot two of Johnson Addition and was constructed in 1958 as a small, ranch style structure. It was built or faced in brick and has vinyl replacement windows.

Michael Mercho, owner of the property, said the property was purchased in 2016 and was approved for a secondary replat for two new homes. Mark asked Michael what is being built in place of the current residence. Michael stated that two residences will be built in place. He mentioned that he will be adhering to the Carmel Old Town overlay architectural guidelines.

It was mentioned that the 60-day demolition delay ends in approximately one week. Rosemary opined that she didn't think it was a house the Commission wanted to save. Sue and Curtis both concurred. Rosemary made a motion to allow for demolition of the structure and Curtis seconded. Motion approved 4-0 (Fred left the meeting moments earlier).

9. Other Business

None

10. Announcements

None

11. Adjournment

Nick adjourned the meeting at 7:29 pm.



Nick Davis, Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission Chairperson



Recording Secretary Joshua Biggs